Geog 696
Molan Choi
April 4, 2011
Debrief for Briton's preproposal

Debrief

For Briton's pre-proposal, overall, it is great and the flow of it is very smooth. More citations would make paper much professional. First paragraph is good for introduction, more specific and concise explanation is needed for describing per-pixel based analysis for mentioning paradigm change. Second paragraph is also well-written. If the first sentence is more specific, it would be better. Some sentences should go to the third part, which is the methods part. For the third paragraph, more specific methods are required for what kind of classification is needed for savannah, what are the steps for pre-processing and processing, and which algorithms will be used for segmentation and classification for eCognition, which software has OBIA analysis.

Key Points

For the first paragraph, which would be introduction part, he well wrote about background of classification of savannah, study justification of Object Based Image Analysis (OBIA), and thesis sentence. From subject idea to purpose statement is going smoothly.   If I say something about specific details, the first sentence can be more general or inclusive. I think some researchers or someone who is interested in this area can have amount of knowledge for this, it would be better the first sentence would be more generous and comprehensive than edgy. For the second sentence, I agree with first idea that savannahs is one of the most burned areas, also there is citation that support his idea, but I am not sure about the second idea. It is historically difficult to classify or not much research has been about this area. If he has supporting references, it would be a confident sentence. Then he talked about remote sensing and digital image processing right away, but I guess if there is more background for savannah even though not in the preproposal, for proposal, it would be helpful for his argument. For the third, fourth, and fifth sentences, he talked about change paradigm from per-pixel based analysis to OBIA. It is good explanation, but if it has concise explanation for per-pixel based, it would be much better. For OBIA explanation, also if he has supporting citations for OBIA, it would be much helpful. Finer sentence is needed for explanation about per-pixel based analysis and explanation. For the last sentence of the first paragraph, his purpose sentence has good verb usage and integrating idea of mapping savannah classification with advanced digital image processing skill, OBIA to have knowledge of lesser known environment.

For the second paragraph, which would be a data part, he also wrote well about set the limitations of the study scope, details about data sets, how to obtain the datasets, and ancillary data sets. Good start with limitations of "are anticipated to not require any in-situ data collection." Also it is a good explanation for how to obtain major datasets. Specific details are great, so if he put the first sentence like "the data sets needed for this study will be acquired GeoEye 4 bands as main datasets and digital elevation models, site history databases, soil moisture databases soil type databases, nutrient content databases, burn scar maps, and other DEM derived datasets as ancillary datasets," or more concise sentence than this one would be helpful as the first sentence. Right before the end of

paragraph, he mentioned classification. It would be better if it is put in the third paragraph, which is the methods part, and the end of sentence can be also included to the third paragraph, which tells methods.

For the third paragraph, which is method part, it is well described about eCogntion and OBIA, but more specific details are needed. First, what kind of classification he needs to do for this study should be clear for savannah. Then it would be better if he separates pre-processing part and processing part for digital image processing.   For pre-processing, he would need to spatial enhancement, radiometric enhancement, and spectral enhancement, or at least he needs to specify what kind of enhancement he will need for this study and this datasets. Then specific details about processing are needed such as which algorithms for segmentation will be used or tested and then which algorithms for classifications will be used or tested.   Also considering is needed for how big is datasets, because processing for segmentation vary depending on the size of datasets, so awareness of the size of savannah area is needed.

Overall, it is well-written and the flow is smooth. I am expecting well-written proposal.